

2024-September-17: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

FINAL

Date: Tuesday, 17 September 2024, 11:00 UTC

Attendees

Executive Council:

Oscar Robles	LACNIC	Chair
John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Vice-Chair
Hans Petter Holen (HPH)	RIPE NCC	Treasurer
Paul Wilson (PW)	APNIC	

Observers:

Nirmal Manic (NM)	AFRINIC
Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Jeremy Harrison (JH)	APNIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Michael Abejuela (MA)	ARIN
Bill Sandiford (BS)	ARIN
Ernesto Majo (EM)	LACNIC
Eduardo Jimenez (EJ)	LACNIC
Athina Fragkouli (AF)	RIPE NCC

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat
Laureana Pavon (LP)	Minutes

New and Updated Action Items

New Action Item 240917-1: The legal team to email the latest edits on the Principles document to the NRO EC shortly after this meeting. The EC will have time until Friday to share any comments. If there are no comments by then, the document will be considered approved and the process will continue (the document will be sent back to the ASO drafting team and then to the comms team to prepare for the survey).

New Action Item 240917-2: GV to share with the NRO EC the new timeline prepared by the ASO AC for the ICP-2 review once this timeline is finalized.

New Action Item 240917-3: OR to reply to ICANN saying the NRO EC has no objections regarding Draft-IETF-6man-addr-assign and it should be moved to last call.

New Action Item 240917-4: GV to follow up with Jeremy to see how to proceed to have the RIR-SLA signed by APNIC.

New Resolutions

R-20240917-1: The NRO EC resolves to transfer an NRO contribution of USD 75,000 to UNDESA to support the IGF Secretariat.

Agenda

1.- Welcome

2.- Agenda Review

3.- AFRINIC Update

4.- ICP-2 | ASO AC Monthly Report

5.- ICANN 81 Preparation

6. Draft-IETF-6man-addr-assign

7.- Signature MoU NRO and DNS RF

8.- IGF UNDESA 2024 Contribution

9.- RIR CEO Updates

10.- Minutes Review

- 2024-August-20: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN, APNIC, LACNIC)
- 2024-July-24: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC)

- 2024-June-18: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC)

11.- Next Meetings

- a) Tuesday 15 October Teleconference
- b) 10 - 13 November f2f Meeting Istanbul Turkey
- c) Tuesday 19 November Teleconference
- d) Tuesday 17 December Teleconference

12.- Open Actions Review

13.- AOB

14.- Adjourn

Minutes

1.- Welcome

OR welcomed everyone and the meeting began at 11:00 UTC.

2.- Agenda Review

The agenda was displayed on screen and approved as written.

3.- AFRINIC Update

NM noted that AFRINIC is still waiting for the judgement, which should be ready this month, possibly in two weeks. Also, the AIS meeting took place last week, Benjamin was present, and he gave the update on AFRINIC. Some members of the Council of Elders were also present. They met with the management team in Mauritius and tried to thank the staff for our work and reassure us that things are moving in the right direction. The AIS meeting was successful, many members of the AFRINIC staff gave support to AFNOG in the background and they were very happy with this.

4.- ICP-2 | ASO AC Monthly Report

EJ explained that the legal team received the Principles document from the ASO drafting team. In general, the legal team is OK with the latest version of the document, with some minor comments (typos, clarifications).

AF added that the legal team had two very fruitful sessions with the ASO AC drafting team during the APNIC meeting in Wellington. We have now received the latest version which we

believe is close to final. Now, the expectation is to have final approval of the NRO EC of the Principles and then share the document with the comms team to prepare the survey, which is meant to be launched at the beginning of October (in time for the LACNIC meeting).

After some discussion about the next steps, the following was decided:

New Action Item 240917-1: The legal team to email the latest edits on the Principles document to the NRO EC shortly after this meeting. The EC will have time until Friday to share any comments. If there are no comments by then, the document will be considered approved and the process will continue (the document will be sent back to the ASO drafting team and then to the comms team to prepare for the survey).

OR thanked the legal team for this work and said he looks forward to receiving this document.

GV asked everyone, if possible, to keep him in the loop once the document is approved, as the ASO AC has expressed interest in meeting with the comms team to prepare for the survey.

GV then observed that HC received a request from the ICANN SOAC group for information on the situation of the ICP-2 review. HC prepared a draft but needs to update it with the latest changes to the timeline and other aspects. GV has seen the draft, which is very informational. However, because HC considers that this is going to be public, he wants to make sure that the EC is OK with it before releasing the report letter the SOAC. As soon as GV receives this message from HC, he will send it to the list for the NRO EC to have a look and if there are no issues, HC can send it to the SOAC.

5.- ICANN 81 Preparation

While displaying it on screen, GV walked the group through the list of activities scheduled for the NRO EC during ICANN 81 to be held in Istanbul. He noted that he has shared this list of activities via the mailing list.

GV will work with HPH and the comms staff to prepare for the 5-minute speech during the welcome ceremony.

He informed that ICANN is requesting to have an ICP-2 informational session in Istanbul, which would be on Tuesday (GV received the request just a couple of hours ago). They want to check whether we are ok with having this session with the ICANN community.

JC replied that he would normally provide this report as part of the ASO update during the public session, and that a separate session might be premature at this time.

PW noted JC's point that it needs to be stated clearly what the session will be about, but the opportunity to go through some sort of session with the ICANN community and have that on record could be useful. Explaining that "comments will be noted by the EC and taken into account" might be sufficient, harmless and good to have on record.

JC said that the EC has given the ASO AC the ability to control the process, so he wouldn't like to tell them how they will receive input. He has no objection to having a consultation at ICANN, but doesn't want to impose on the ASO AC.

HPH said that the Principles document should be released for the LACNIC and the other RIR meetings, in which case he sees no problem having something similar at ICANN in Istanbul. We'd also have on record that we consulted at the ICANN meeting. He agreed that the EC definitely needs to make sure the ASO AC feels supported.

OR asked GV to check with HC: "we received this request from ICANN, we don't have a problem having an informational meeting, but it's up to you to decide." GV will raise this with HC.

OR said it would be good for the ASO AC to prepare a roadmap to be aware of what will happen in the upcoming months.

HPH asked GV to update the timeline for the ICP-2 review once he has clarity on this.

GV replied that there is a timeline document sent by KB during the week of the APNIC meeting in Wellington, but the AC needs to meet with the communications group.

New Action Item 240917-2: GV to share with the NRO EC the new timeline prepared by the ASO AC for the ICP-2 review once this timeline is finalized.

6. Draft-IETF-6man-addr-assign

JC explained that we received a draft clarifying the IPv6 address assignment policy (make sure that if there is a new IPv6 assignment policy at the IETF it should be reviewed by the larger community rather than simply by the IESG, <https://www.ietf.org/archive/id/draft-ietf-6man-addr-assign-00.html>). They thought we would like to give our opinion. JC thinks it's a great change, having the community involved. He recommends that OR write back "we have no objection, you should move it to last call."

After some further comments and no objections, the following action item was decided:

New Action Item 240917-3: OR to reply to ICANN saying the NRO EC has no objections regarding Draft-IETF-6man-addr-assign and it should be moved to last call.

7.- Signature MoU NRO and DNS RF

JC said that ARIN has no objection.

OR observed that the NRO EC has already approved moving forward with this, the document is very simple but we have to review it with our lawyers, as it will be signed by OR on behalf of the NRO.

AF will discuss this matter with HPH right after this meeting.

JH has reviewed the document but has not discussed it with PW. He sees no issues but will discuss this internally and confirm via email.

OR added that the EC needs to have a process on how to proceed for future events like this. He sees that Sofia Silva is struggling with DNSRF, so we need to come up with a streamlined process to smooth out this kind of project. After we sign this, OR will suggest something to the lawyers for future situations.

Way forward: OR will wait for AF's or HPH's and PW's comments. EJ will reply to Sofia that we are closer than ever to having this document signed.

8.- IGF UNDESA 2024 Contribution

GV explained that we received the request to receive our annual contribution to UNDESA (USD 75k, the same amount we've been contributing for approximately the last 10 years).

No objections were heard, so the following resolution was approved:

R-20240917-1: The NRO EC resolves to transfer an NRO contribution of USD 75,000 to UNDESA to support the IGF Secretariat.

GV will proceed with the next steps to materialize the contribution, following up with OR.

9.- RIR CEO Updates

JC:

- ARIN had a consultation about changing its fee schedule to allow the board flexibility to each year approve an increase to fees up to 5%. That consultation ended in August, the Board of Trustees considered the input and amended the fee schedule. As part of that, the Board of Trustees also adopted a long-term financial model for the organization which has cost numbers set through 2030. Those numbers are less than a 5% growth in the costs of the organization, which will get us into a balanced situation, where our fees and our operating expenses align. ARIN will be entering a period of fiscal austerity and tight cost management.
- Our elections will be held in October. This year any service member can opt to be a general member. In the past, our number of general members didn't change, but this year the number of members decreased, as those who did not vote were dropped (about 50%).

HPH:

- We have a two-day upcoming board meeting in the following couple of days. There is basically one major topic on the board meeting agenda, which is our activity planning budget.

- HPH has a few proposals to the Board for some slight strengthening of our investigations team and to add quite a bit to the security team.
- On the cost-saving side, we are doing a lot to reduce the data center footprint. We have a lot of really old equipment, so we are changing our old servers and updating everything.
- Looking to the future: we will start the next five-year strategic plan and see the level of activities needed to meet the members' demands.
- HPH is currently acting as chief registry officer himself and discussing recruiting someone for the position.

PW:

- APNIC 58 was held in Wellington, but PW did not attend. Jia Rong did attend even though he has not started his tenure as Director General. He gave a greeting to the community, which was well-received.
- The meeting was pretty successful, though it was a small meeting partly because of the location and partly because it unfortunately clashed with AusNOG meeting.
- The EC considered the budget for 2025 three months earlier than usual, which was good to see.

PH:

- The Cooperation-SIG organized an information session at APNIC 58 on ICP-2. The recording is available (ICP-2, why is it important? https://www.youtube.com/live/Hm_ciJOSwX4).

OR:

- LACNIC is in the middle of board elections. Candidates have already submitted their intentions to run. However, LACNIC has implemented a process to assess their knowledge and skills on corporate and organizational governance and LACNIC processes, so candidates will be announced by mid-October. The number of candidates is much lower than usual (3 to 5 depending on how many pass the evaluation).
- This month the board will approve a fee increase based on inflation during the last 12 months. It will be about 3% and will be the first time we will introduce this fee update.
- Next month LACNIC will have its meeting in Asuncion, Paraguay, where we expect about 600 participants. The place is not so well connected so it will be difficult, but it will be nice to participate in that community.

10.- Minutes Review

- 2024-August-20: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN, APNIC, LACNIC)
- 2024-July-24: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC)
- 2024-June-18: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: APNIC)

OR asked that everyone who has minutes pending for review to please do so.

11.- Next Meetings

- a) Tuesday 15 October Teleconference
- b) 10 - 13 November f2f Meeting Istanbul Turkey
- c) Tuesday 19 November Teleconference
- d) Tuesday 17 December Teleconference

OR suggested cancelling the NRO EC teleconference scheduled for 19 November. All agreed

12.- Open Actions Review

Action Item 240820-2: GV to look for the questions the NRO EC sent for the ICANN Board to ask at the ASO public session with the ICANN Board and send them to OR and the other members of the EC so they can prepare the questions for ICANN 81. **ONGOING**

GV is working on this task and will complete the action soon.

13.- AOB

OR observed that the RIR-SLA has been signed by HPH, JC and himself, now we need APNIC's signature.

If this can wait until October, PW suggested that Jia Rong can sign it. Otherwise, PW must look for someone else to sign it.

New Action Item 240917-4: GV to follow up with Jeremy to see how to proceed to have the RIR-SLA signed by APNIC.

14.- Adjourn

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 12:10 UTC.