2024-August-20: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference

FINAL

Date: Tuesday, 20 August 2024, 11:00 UTC

Attendees

Executive Council:

John Curran (JC)	ARIN	Vice-Chair
Hans Petter Holen (HPH)	RIPE NCCC	Treasurer
Ernesto Majo (EM)	LACNIC	

Observers:

Nirmal Manic (NM)	AFRINIC
Pablo Hinojosa (PH)	APNIC
Richard Jimmerson (RJ)	ARIN
Michael Abejuela (MA)	ARIN
Bill Sandiford (BS)	ARIN
Ernesto Majo (EM)	LACNIC
Eduardo Jimenez (EJ)	LACNIC
Athina Fragkouli (AF)	RIPE NCC

Secretariat:

German Valdez (GV)	NRO Secretariat
Laureana Pavon (LP)	Minutes

New and Updated Action Items

New Action Item 240820-1: GV and OR to coordinate to prepare a 10-minute goodwill message for OR to present remotely at AIS on 11th Sept.

New Action Item 240820-2: GV to look for the questions the NRO EC sent for the ICANN Board to ask at the ASO public session with the ICANN Board and send them to OR and the other members of the EC so they can prepare the questions for ICANN 81.

New Resolutions

R-20240820-1: The NRO EC resolves that HPH will assume his position as ASO EC Chair for 2025 on 1st November 2024.

R-20240820-2: The NRO EC resolves to approve NRO Collaboration with DNS Research Federation with the cost of 7000 USD and the NRO EC Chair has the authority to sign on behalf of the NRO. This Resolution supersedes R-20240618-1.

R-20240820-3: The NRO EC resolves to appoint Germán Valdez, Hans Petter Holen, and Joh Curran to the IETF Community Coordination Group (ccg).

Agenda

1.- Welcome

2.- Agenda Review

3.- AFRINIC Update

4.- ICP-2 | ASO AC Monthly Report

5.- AIS Participation

6.- ICANN 81 Preparation

7.- Coordination CCG/PACG

8.- NRO EC roles November/December 2024

9.- IANA SLA Signing

10.- NRO Collaboration with DNS Research Federation

11.- RIR CEO Updates

12.- Minutes Review

- 2024-July-24: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN, APNIC, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)

- 2024-June-18: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN, APNIC, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)
- 2024-May-14: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN)
- 2024-April-16: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN)

13.- Next Meetings

a) Tuesday 17 September Teleconference

b) Tuesday 15 October Teleconference

c) 10 - 13 November f2f Meeting Istanbul Turkey

d) Tuesday 19 November Teleconference

14.- Open Actions Review

15.- AOB

16.- Adjourn

Minutes

1.- Welcome

OR welcomed everyone and the meeting began at 11:00 UTC.

2.- Agenda Review

 The agenda was displayed on screen and approved as written.

3.- AFRINIC Update

OR thanked NM for his continued conversation.

NM informed that AFRINIC is still waiting for the court rulings and that the lawyers believe we may hear something in September to see if we'll have the receiver back. Also, a member of the staff has resigned, and we cannot recruit someone to replace him. He thanked the CFOs for their proposal for meeting in person, but it appears that he will not be able to attend.

HPH said that he was sorry to hear that and that if there is anything the NRO can do, NM should let them know.

4.- ICP-2 | ASO AC Monthly Report

OR noted that the EC had formally communicated our feedback on the ASO AC's draft Principles document.

From the Secretariat's perspective, GV shared that ASO AC will have a special meeting to discuss the NRO EC's feedback tomorrow at 12:00 pm UTC and that the Legal Team will be present to assist them.

5.- AIS Participation

OR explained that the AIS organizers are asking the NRO whether we will be participating in AIS Program. He noted that the EC has not discussed virtual participation.

GV mentioned a message he received from Nancy Dotse suggesting tentative slots for a goodwill message, a longer slot for a panel discussion on ICP-2 review, and the possibility of participating in the Open Day.

JC suggested they ask AFRINIC to look for subject matter experts to participate remotely if at all possible.

OR said that he could do a short goodwill message.

JC agreed, adding that it is important to be at AIS, even if it is remotely.

New Action Item 240820-1: GV and OR to coordinate to prepare a 10-minute goodwill message for OR to present remotely at AIS on 11th Sept.

6.- ICANN 81 Preparation

GV explained that he added some topics that we need to deal with in addition to our regular agenda when preparing to attend a f2f ICANN meeting: we need to decide if we're going to meet with the ICANN Board chair, what kind of questions we are going to submit to the ICANN Board for the ASO public session, and because it's the annual general meeting we normally have a 5-minute slot to give a short presentation.

OR said that he will not be present at the ICANN meeting as the NRO EC chair, so we should decide who would be willing to give this speech during the opening session.

HPH volunteered to present the opening remarks and asked about the 'How It Works' technical session.

GV replied that he is waiting for an answer from ICANN staff to know if they will have that session.

HPH said that he would like information on when it will be as he has prepared his people for that session since it is in the RIPE NCC Service region, but he need confirmation as soon as possible. There will be a strong presence of RIPE NCC staff in Istanbul.

Regarding other sessions, JC noted that they have a courtesy invitation to meet with the ICANN Chair. Unless we have something specific to discuss, we shouldn't waste everyone's valuable time just to have a meeting. As for questions to the ICANN Board, he believes we have any for them but imagine they will have some for us. We should start working on preparing questions for the ICANN Board to ask us in Istanbul.

New Action Item 240820-2: GV to look for the questions the NRO EC sent for the ICANN Board to ask at the ASO public session with the ICANN Board and send them to OR and the other members of the EC so they can prepare the questions for ICANN 81.

HPH agreed. Also, ICANN is in the process of finalizing their three-year strategic plan, so we need to read that carefully and see if anything needs clarification. We should see if we want to give some public or private feedback on the wording.

GV noted that this plan might include something about the restart of independent reviews of the supporting organizations, so it might have an impact on our own processes of independent review of the ASO and next year budget. So indeed, the EC needs to look at that.

JC asked whether the time and room for the NRO EC had been decided. GV replied that the room has not been assigned yet, but the NRO EC usually has a half day on Monday and a full day on Tuesday. We will confirm this depending on the topics we need to discuss.

HPH noted that there is a proposal for a meeting between the NRO and RSSAC, though he is not sure what the topic would be.

Before moving on to the next agenda item, GV shared that he had stressed to the ICANN staff that if we are going to have a follow-up session with the GAC, the request needs to be sent as soon as possible so we can prepare properly.

7.- Coordination CCG/PACG

 On the topic of coordination between the Communication Coordination Group and the PACG, OR said he had suggested that it would be wise to have them coordinated in crisis communication in case we need to do something in the future. Would the other want OR to keep following up on this?

JC said if we think this is important, he will support it. We all have our own crisis communication plans, but he is not sure how we coordinate them through the CCG. He wondered if there was a major crisis, something we were all talking about at the same time, what would be the goal for having a more coupled crisis communication plan would be, i.e. what we are trying to achieve, as there would be responsiveness tradeoffs with doing more coordinated communications.

HPH said he sees two levels we would agree on. First, if we agree that if we have a major crisis and we need to act with one voice externally, how do we put together a joint crisis team so as not to lose any time (CEOs, legal, one or more comms members?). The other thing is that we would

start to draft some communication in case A, B or C happens, but that requires much critical thought.

OR said he would follow up in the next level of detail. The second part of what HPH suggested seems more relevant, having this conversation and questioning ourselves to have clarity if we ever have to make that decision. This is an interesting exercise.

JC agreed.

OR asked the others to share who could also be part of this conversation.

8.- NRO EC roles November/December 2024

GV said we need to define how the chairmanship of the NRO will rotate. Options: we ask JC to take over for December/November or we ask HPH to step up earlier and take over from OR two months in advance.

All agreed that HPH would be the best option and decided that HPH will start his term as NRO EC Chair on 1st November 2024. The CCGs will continue to be chaired as they are now, HPH doesn't want to force an earier change in the CCGs unless they see the need themselves.

R-20240820-1: The NRO EC resolves that HPH will assume his position as NRO EC Chair for 2025 on 1st November 2024.

9.- IANA SLA Signing

JC suggested taking up the suggestion to sign individually and circulate the document, then send them the signed versions ASAP.

All agreed.

10.- NRO Collaboration with DNS Research Federation

GV recalled that they had discussed this collaboration in June. There was a proposal from Sofia Silva and we agreed to support this collaboration. However, back then, GV said that the cost included in the proposal document was 5k USD but has realized that he had made a mistake and that it is actually 7k USD.

All agreed to this new amount.

EJ said that last week we received the draft MoU from Sofia Silva and there are no issues apart from the 7k USD, but there is the question of who would be signing, the NRO EC or each individual RIR.

JC replied that it would be best if we could simply have the NRO EC Chair sign for the collaboration effort with the support of a resolution to this effect.

HPH and OR agreed with this approach.

R-20240820-2: The NRO EC resolves to approve NRO Collaboration with DNS Research Federation with the cost of 7000 USD and the NRO EC Chair has the authority to sign on behalf of the NRO. This Resolution supersedes R-20240618-1.

11.- RIR CEO Updates

JC:

- This week we have our board strategy workshop. Amongst other issues, we're dealing with questions about where the registry system is going and the nature of the relationship between the RIRs and with ICANN in the next 5-10 years.
- We had a community consultation with the community about adjusting the fee schedule with inflation. Opinions were split, with no clear guidance one way or the other. The underlying message is that we've hit the right size for ARIN. We're now committed to a fairly stable organization which means going forward any new programs will displace existing programs.

HPH:

- It's holiday season in Europe, so it's very quiet, with an internal review of the activity plan and budget.
- Next year we will kick off the next five-year strategic process, so we're also preparing for that.
- A task force on the charging scheme was formed. Their first meeting will be next week.
- There is also an initiative for a task force or similar on whether or not the RIPE NCC is set up in the best possible way to handle future challenges and long-term funding.

OR:

- We are also working on our operational plan. 2025 will be the last year for the current strategic period and we will also kick off the new strategic plan soon.
- The operational plan will be the first one with the new scheme that will allow us to increase fees with inflation. We also have long-term investments with good rates (~5%), so we believe it will be good for our finances next year.
- The next LACNIC meeting will be held in Asuncion, Paraguay. It will be the first LACNIC meeting in this country, a joint LACNIC / LACNOG meeting.

PH:

- APNIC 58 will meet in a couple of weeks' time, there will be a board meeting.
- Jia Rong Low will officially begin his position as Director General of APNIC in October. PW will not be attending APNIC 58.
- APNIC is working on the transition and onboarding of Jia Rong.
- Jia Rong's presence in Istanbul is still to be decided.

- There needs to be a process for onboarding him to the NRO EC, so any help will be appreciated.
- We will very likely not have anything on ICP-2 in Wellington yet, but we decided to keep this session as an informational session.

Regarding onboarding Jia Rong to the NRO EC, JC observed that it's important to get clarity on this ASAP. JC knows there's a lot to get him up to speed and onboard, but to the extent possible, it would be helpful to have some clarity before Istanbul.

PH replied that Jia Rong will be fully on board in October. The October NRO EC meeting is important for us / him in particular, and it also might be the last one for OR. Ernesto Majó has much experience observing the NRO EC, but Jia Rong does not. We are working on this.

OR told PH to feel free to consider as many slots as needed to have the conversation with Jia Rong. He suggested that it might be more relevant to have a one-on-one chat with him, which he is more than happy to have.

HPH echoed having one-on-one meetings with Jia Rong.

12.- Minutes Review

2024-July-24: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN, APNIC, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)

2024-June-18: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN, APNIC, LACNIC, RIPE NCC)

2024-May-14: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN)

2024-April-16: Minutes NRO EC Teleconference - DRAFT (Pending: ARIN)

13.- Next Meetings

a) Tuesday 17 September Teleconference

b) Tuesday 15 October Teleconference

c) 10 - 13 November f2f Meeting Istanbul Turkey

d) Tuesday 19 October Teleconference

OR suggested that, while we haven't heard any confirmation from APNIC, it would be wise to keep the November 19 online meeting.

14.- Open Actions Review

Action Item 240724-2: GV to coordinate payment of the NRO sponsorship for the African Internet Summit to be held in September 2024 in Mauritius at the 25K level (Diamond). **IN PROGRESS**

Action Item 240724-3: The Secretariat to draft a letter to the IGFSA and send it to the list for NRO EC review (the NRO will be winding down support and moving to supporting regional and national IGFs directly). **IN PROGRESS**

Re Action Item 240724-3, JC, HPH, and PW are still pending approval of the letter to the IGFSA.

Action Item 240724-4: The NRO EC to send to the mailing list any comments about the request received from the IETF regarding IETF Trust Restructuring & Transfer of IANA Intellectual Property. The goal is for the NRO Chair to provide consent to the proposed restructuring of the Trust, as the IETF cannot move forward with the restructuring without consent from the NRO chair. **CLOSED**

Action Item 240724-5: The NRO EC to appoint three members to the IETF Community Coordination Group (ccg). **CLOSED**

JC moved to appoint GV, HPH and JC to be part of the Community Coordination Group (ccg). No opposition was heard so the motion carried.

R-20240820-3: The NRO EC resolves to appoint Germán Valdez, Hans Petter Holen, and Joh Curran to the IETF Community Coordination Group (ccg).

Action Item 240618-3: OR to send the latest version of the ICP-2 Implementation Procedures document to Sally, AJ, and John Crain (cc Tripty, Carlos Reyes, and Steve Sheng). **CLOSED**

Action Item 240618-4: PW to send an email to Nii Quaynor (or AFNOG) to inform them that at this point it is unlikely that any of the RIRs will be sending their staff to Mauritius (no RIR staff will be present for AIS 2024). **CLOSED**

15.- AOB

GV reminded the EC that we have a meeting with Sofia Silva this Thursday.

HPH noted that she had asked if we are willing to support any of the initiatives of open source for RPKI. He has replied, but has not seen any replies from the rest of the EC.

OR said that this should be up for conversation. He asked whether we are including this as an indicator of success in our strategies. As a standalone initiative, it will not be sustainable.

If we do this through the NRO, JC wondered whether each RIR would keep their direct relationship as a customer.

OR suggested that the RIRs make their own efforts in this sense, as the work we are doing relies heavily on these solutions. But let's have this conversation, it is on the agenda for the meeting with Sofia.

16.- Adjourn

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting concluded at 12:15 UTC.